

## **Knowing by Doing - ESL Teacher's Professional Development**

**Dr.B.Samrajya Lakshmi**

M.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., M.Ed., P.G.C.T.E., C.Li.Sc. LMISTE

Professor of English

Lakireddy Balireddy College of Engineering

Mylavaram, Krishna (DT.). Andhra Pradesh, India

### **Abstract**

The principal aim of this study is to examine how reflective practice enables ESL teachers to make sense of their professional worlds as well as make significant and worthwhile change within themselves and in their teaching practices. This researcher gathered qualitative data about their reflective practices from multiple resources (namely, questionnaire survey, journal entries of the subjects, transcripts of video recordings of lessons and self-feedback entries, transcripts of peer observation of lessons, and post-reflection discussions). The data were subjected to content analysis. This paper examines the obstacles in the way of effective ESL teacher education in India and finds a possible way forward in the Reflective Approach. The post reflection discussion shows that the teacher believes in reflection as it provides an opportunity to observe classroom practices thoroughly and in turn modifies the teacher's performance. Reflective practice through journal writing is thus found to be an effective means for teacher's self – appraisal and learning.

**Key Words:** reflective practice, Journal writing, feed back, classroom practice, teacher –learning

### **Introduction**

#### **Journal Writing**

A teaching journal is an ongoing written account of observations, reflections, and other thoughts about teaching, usually in the form of a notebook, or electronic mode, which serves as a source of discussion, reflection, or evaluation. The journal may be used as a record of incidents, problems, and insights that occurred during lessons; it may be an account of a class that the teacher would like to review or return to later. 'Writing a teaching journal provides an opportunity for teachers to use the process of writing to describe and explore their own teaching practices' (Ho & Richards, 1993, pp.8). Keeping a reflective journal enables teachers to think about the issues they confront during their day-to-day classroom teaching, and helps to develop reflective and critical thinking skills, and prepare for class room discussions. Reflective journal is not a summary of the lesson taught.

## Literature Survey

Case studies are bounded systems (Smith, 1978) that allow the teacher to concentrate attention on the way particular groups of people confront specific problems, taking a holistic view of the situation. Even the famous 'case method' was originally grounded in the belief that the teaching of scientific principles should precede the development of skills in their application (Schon, 1983). In 1987, Donald Schon recommended reflective practice as a way for beginners in a discipline to recognize consonance between their own individual practices and those of successful practitioners. As defined by Schon, reflective practice involves thoughtfully considering one's own experiences in applying knowledge to practice while being coached by professionals in the discipline (Schon, 1996). Boud and Walker (1998) suggested that teacher-coaches who created an environment of trust would be better at establishing a context in which useful reflection could take place. The case study provides the teacher with "insight, discovery, and interpretation" (Merriam, 1988, p. 10). Because it is field-based, it allows the teacher to explore phenomena directly from the human experience. "Teacher who evaluates the work seeks to interpret, explain the meanings of observed situations or events, put them in a context, assume potential sequences, and use the pedagogical knowledge and experience to account for the studied events" (Kremer-Hayon, 1993). Nunan (1992) inferred that thirty percent of teachers decisions involved management and class organization and that their language decisions most often involved vocabulary, pronunciation and grammar. Nunan (1992) concluded that the teachers' plans had a significant impact on their lessons, although their lessons were substantially modified during instruction. Case studies are of value in refining theory and suggesting complexities for further investigation, as well as helping to establish the limits of generalizability" (Stake, 1994). The case study aims at expanding the theory that is available on teacher self-evaluation by providing teachers' feedback on their experience. Yin (2003, 2009) views the goal of case studies as understanding complex social phenomena, and the real-life events such as organizational and managerial process.

Keeping reflective journal means that the teacher has a record. This is crucially important. (Bolton, Gilliehet, 2005). Reflective activity makes a powerful contribution to the learning of many professionals – engineers, doctors and nurses, police officers, architects and lawyers, to name but a few. (Pollard, Andrew, 2005)

### **Procedures adopted for data collection**

This researcher has maintained separate files for participant teacher with her pseudonym. In the file allotted for each participant, the researcher kept a copy of the teacher's profile containing her personal details, designation, educational qualifications, years of experience, objective in choosing the teaching profession, and a copy of the transcript of the interview. The information was obtained through interviews on various emergent themes/strategies/patterns, which were considered important.

Before the subject sets about her exploratory practices, this researcher administered her with semi-structured questionnaire. The purpose was to make the teacher reflect on her own teaching and realize her strengths and weaknesses. The questions focused on the teacher's beliefs about ESL teaching-learning process, teaching strategies, opinion on reflective practice, and the use of bilingualism while teaching.

The participant was led into free discussions with this researcher about her research and

about the possible means for improving her professional competence. Teacher decided to take up journal writing and decided to spend a minimum of five minutes to write about her experience and reflect on the problems encountered either by introspection or through discussion with a colleague. While writing an entry in the journal, the teacher was asked to reflect on the following:

- How was the class planned?
- Is there any deviation from the plan?
- What types of questions were asked by the teacher at the beginning, middle, and towards the end?
- What about the student-teacher, student-student interaction in class?
- Was the class a success or a failure?
- How can it be made more effective next time?
- How will the teacher plan for the next class based on the previous reflection?

The participant was also guided to make journal entries after each class, reflecting on her experiences and with suggestions for improvements for the next class. To encourage her, to make a start, a list of questions was distributed. The teacher participant was also asked to write a lesson plan for each lesson she was willing to teach. The entries, the teacher made in her journals were unguided, but the list of questions was only to motivate her for the purpose.

The journal entries made by the teacher participant were collected into her file, her way of progression qualitatively in day-to-day teaching practice was registered, and the new methods and materials devised because of regular reflection were determined. The improvement in her questioning pattern and classroom interaction, student involvement and learner evaluation techniques employed by the teacher were collected from the teacher's point of view. A small discussion on these entries was conducted separately with the teacher, to arrive at a better conclusion, which proves the effect of reflective practice in language teaching – learning process. The observer entered the class to be observed five minutes earlier and sat in the last row without disturbing the students. She observed the following in particular:

- How the teacher motivated the class
- Introduced the topic
- Continued with the lesson
- Interacted with the class
- Maintained interaction among the students
- Analyzed and corrected students' errors
- Used reinforcement techniques
- Spent time fruitfully
- Used question types
- Concluded the class

After the class, the researcher spent 10 minutes discussing her observation with the teacher, allowing the teacher to respond. While observing the class, the observer recorded her observations as descriptive passages in her notes.

At the end of the longitudinal research, which lasted for about one and a half year, the participants were made to respond to an informal post reflective interview that focused on her

perceptions about the effectiveness of reflective practice in ESL teacher's professional development.

### **Role of the researcher in the subjects' reflective practice**

The researcher's role was that of an observer-cum-participant. She conducted a questionnaire survey of the subject's beliefs, studied the records of the subject's reflective practice (such as journal entries), and took part in review discussions about reflections. Whenever the participant gave her experiences and opinions, the researcher carefully documented them. She also made a time-to-time verification of the data through discussions with the participants.

### **Description of the teacher participant**

Teacher participant teaches English in an engineering college on the outskirts of Vijayawada. She has 15 years of experience of teaching English at the undergraduate level. She is doing research in English language teaching. She has worked for some time as a communicative skills trainer as well.

When the researcher approached the teacher for taking her consent to participate in her research, she readily gave her acceptance as she felt it to be an opportunity to improve her teaching skills. Of all the strategies of reflection, the teacher opted for journal writing.

### **Findings through an informal interview**

In an informal interview conducted by the researcher, the teacher expressed her personal opinions about various aspects of ESL teaching.

#### **(a) Reflective practice**

*I came to know of it very lately. The professionals can express their capacity for expressing, analyzing, and renovating the knowledge they use in their work in an active process. As teacher of language, I could adopt the practice that is retrospective in nature to improvise our perception towards work. It would definitely assist us in identifying the ideas and theories actually implemented by teachers while teaching.*

#### **(b) Teaching aids used**

*As teacher of English, I think we can use a lot of material/equipment available around us to make students understand the mechanism of the language. As a teacher I had used very commonly available material-news papers, storybooks, novels comics, how to use manuals, advertisements, movies, T.V news, internet, various soft wares-at my discretion as teaching aid.*

#### **(c) Teaching strategy used**

*Here are some of the teaching strategies I had adopted at different levels.*

*I felt that the students need to have a strong base of reading in order to take comfortably without fumbling for words. However, the standard of the students was not very motivating. Therefore, I used comics as a teaching aid. I would make students read comics that helped them to pick the spoken form of the language. In addition, it helped them understand how they can get on with the language with the vocabulary they had. Another interesting aspect of comics is it helped them pick the paralinguistic elements also. For e.g. ---shhhh-- --, psst--, vow, hissss. Comics being a picture representation help the student visualize things easily. Of course, I used them for limited sessions, i.e 2-3 periods only. My purpose was to make them understand how they could adopt different strategies for evolving their language skills and speak without hesitation. Of course, I noticed that success was limited to those students who put into practice.*

*Some times students are unable to express themselves sensibly, as they lack a good choice of words. Here their word power acted as a limitation. In order to help them improve their word power, I used many methods. But, the initial method was making students read news papers. As this activity was of passive nature of students' interest used to be low. So, to gear them up, I used to instruct them to cut the headlines of their interest and stick them on a book. They could make use of it later also. Then, they extended this activity to small articles. One big advantage of this activity was, it could be done at home. Next day, the articles thus collected were used for reading purposes. Here, their pronunciation and intonation were corrected. This is one of the most fruitful exercises that helped students initiate into reading newspapers. Students who persisted with this habit later improved their proficiency of language and became confident speakers. In addition, this helped them to pick current language and thoughts.*

*One of the most difficult tasks for a language teacher is make students talk in the class. I adopted the simple method of making students (all) to speak a line or two in an attempt create a story. In this exercise of story- telling students created a story together. I would pick one student who is supposed to give start the story with a single sentence. Then he would pick another student of his choice.*

#### **(d) Use of bilingualism**

*Use of mother tongue in language classroom helps to connect with students first, also, the students do not develop aversion for English. It definitely helps to break the ice and bridge the gap initially. Once students are initiated into actual learning of language, it can be avoided. However, I do not really believe a language can be learned in another medium.*

#### **(f) Strategies of feedback**

*I never went for any scientific form of feedback for my classes. I used to ask them personally about their opinion of the class. However, I always made sure to receive their feedback in a constructive way. A few students candidly expressed their inability to follow the lessons. Some students would give genuine suggestions on how to improve the classroom situation. Students often expressed their interest to learn in an interactive manner. In this experimental teaching experience, the feed back of the students was quite encouraging.*

#### **Reflections through journal writing**

The Teacher feels that reflective practice is an active process, which brings out teachers' capacity for expressing, analyzing and renovating the knowledge they use in their classrooms. She also says that this process is retrospective in nature and helps in improving our perception of our day-to-day work.

The teacher believes that language as a means of communication can be learnt not only through formal instruction but also unknowingly through social interactions. She also feels that accuracy in communication is very important. Like a conventional teacher, she too believes that drill and practice can bring in accuracy in language use. She is of the opinion that students should learn speaking and listening skills so that they can be efficient learners in reading and writing.

Eight extracts from her journal entries with an analysis of each extract are given below:

**Extract I:** *Students had learning difficulty regarding /s/, /z/, /dz/, /ʒ/. They would be substituting one for another. But after a little practice, making them hear the sounds, they slowly caught the sound. Students were given an idea how phonetics play a role in daily communication. Relating*



*to wrong usages leading to comical situations help students sustain their interest.*

After reflection, the teacher tries to make students learn effectively by knowing their problem and through giving them common usages. She makes her students realize their own mistakes while speaking. She helps them learn concepts in an entertaining way. It can be inferred from the extract that the teacher wants to motivate her students by making them use the language in class with due importance to pronunciation. Thus, the teacher has developed her methodological skill, and, through investigation, she could even improve her evaluation skills.

**Extract II:** *Telugu medium students have a difficulty in distinguishing /s/, /z/, and /dz/. On discussion with my colleague, I think it is better that they write in Telugu how the word is pronounced. This suggestion helped students overcome the difficulty of trying to memorize the symbol and sound.*

The teacher uses peer discussion to develop strategies for effective learning in her students, even those who have come from the vernacular medium of instruction. She taught sounds through correlating the same sound in students' mother tongue to help them gain accuracy in their learning of English sounds. Through reflection, she even finds alternative texts, which may suit her students' linguistic level.

**Extract III:** *I make them do uninterrupted reading for five minutes. After watching them getting bored, I then asked them to stop after five minutes. Now I asked them to count the number of words they have read roughly. Then simple questions based on the memory of the passage and comprehension was asked. Attentive readers easily answered them from the inference drawn from the text.*

The teacher's experience with her students' reading, made her realize that silent, unguided reading would not be profitable. Therefore, she motivated her students to read the passage by giving questions that would make them comprehend the passage.

**Extract IV:** *I use this hour, to get the feel of the writing style of Abdul Kalam whose language is precise and aptly suited for describing technical aspects. 20 minutes is given for reading the text. Then, they were asked to trace the early life to Abdul from their understanding. By finding the students silent, I thought of making the students think actively. In a way to make the students interact, I asked each selected student to give only one point. Thus they built the summary of the chapter. Students are then given another 5 minutes to summarize what they have read. This task helps them to recall words, expressions used in the text. On the whole, the class could be conducted as planned. But students from Telugu medium background are not forthcoming. This area is to be checked.*

While administering a reading exercise in her class, the teacher found it difficult to make the students summarize the text. Furthermore, she found the students getting bored. However, after reflection, she decided to ask each student to give a sentence on his or her own based on the text read. Thus, she was successful in making the students of her class summarize the text.

**Extract V:** *They can pick a passage of 800 words length approximately and try to read it within 7mts in the first seven days. Then, they can try to consciously reduce the time to 5mts in the next seven days. To help them remain in track and improve their memory skills – One more activity I introduced.*

In the teacher's journal, this entry comes after her reflection on ways of improving her students' reading speed. She gives tips to help her students read faster while gaining knowledge

of watch phrases, expressions used, idea incorporated, etc. She becomes competent enough to device her own strategies for effective teaching and, as she says elsewhere in her journal, she shares them with her colleagues. Thus, reflection has helped her play an expanded role as a mentor to her colleagues as well.

**Extract VI:** *I noticed that usually students don't know beyond Oxford Dictionary and their search is confined to only meanings of the words. On further probing, some students told about parts of speech. I wondered which dictionary I could recommend. Then I decided that I must ask them to use a learner's dictionary, whether it was Oxford or Cambridge or Longman or Macmillan. Next, they must begin to look for phonetic transcription, stress mark, synonyms, how they occur as various parts of speech etc., this kind of exercise was given for laboratory activity.*

Normally, English teachers ask their students to use a dictionary, and Oxford is often the inevitable choice. But this teacher wants her students to use the dictionary for different purposes, and the reflection on this helps her identify learner's dictionaries as most appropriate.

**Extract VII:** *Here the students from vernacular medium of instruction need help while converting direct speech into reported speech. Once they are explained the enormity of their mistake, they correct themselves. This is not true with all the students present but it is true with students who are highly motivated. So, I decided to ask them to come and approach me during my free time. The students followed my advice. Their keen desire acted as a motivating factor for me.*

While teaching reported speech, the teacher found that the students from vernacular medium of instruction needed help. Since only small minorities of motivated students were able to learn from her corrections, she decided, on reflection, to ask them to meet her outside the classroom for help.

### **Post-reflection discussion**

The researcher had a 15-minutes discussion with the participant teacher. When she was asked to respond on the importance of journal writing, she expressed her faith in this process for professional development.

The teacher feels confident of her classroom teaching after reflection. She says that she could understand where she stands in ESL teaching as she could study her performance thoroughly and strive to bring about improvement.

*I know beforehand my target for the class and, after reflection, I know where I stand. This helps me study my performance and gives me scope to gain improvement, giving me a sense of achievement.*

*This gives us an opportunity to record our observations of the class and reflect upon them. This recording helps us to improvise on our performance. Also, over the years, it helps us to note and compare our performances at class level. ...English today is a means of earning job and not a subject of pleasure. High stakes make it essential for every teacher to be active and appraise their performance. Moreover, these methods are helpful in the absence of other methods, one helpful in the absence of other learned ones in the department and training programmes.*

From the post-reflection discussion it is evident that the teacher believes that reflection provides opportunities to observe classroom practices thoroughly and enable the teacher to modify her plan such that there will be an improvement in the performance. She finds reflective

practice as the best available means for teacher self-appraisal and teacher learning.

### **Findings of the study**

The findings that emerge from the detailed analysis made above (about the gains the teacher in the study made as a result of her reflective practice) are organized in this section as follows:

#### ***Decisions about timing through reflective practice***

The reflective practice of the teacher in this study helped her to be sensitive to the time needed by the students to carry out an activity, and make adjustments in time allocation. It also helped her estimate the number of activities that could be set in a period. Furthermore, it helped the teacher identify and assess the attention span of the students.

Teacher was found to plan her lesson dividing the duration of the class equally among all her students, thus finding the time to motivate her students to interact in English both with her and among themselves. Time became an important factor for making her students summarize and recall the words and expressions learned from the text, and she was able to manage it with ease.

#### ***Decisions about solving the students' problems through reflective practice***

The teacher could also assess the kinds of problems that students had in understanding certain concepts and instructions. Though the classes differed slightly in 'personality' and 'perception', surprisingly, the kinds of problems that the students faced were rather similar.

The teacher could identify the students' problems, tried out different methods of explanation within the lesson series, and thus arrived at workable method of solving the students' problems.

Before the process of reflection, the teacher taught a 'poem' by merely explaining the meanings of the words literally. Constant reflection made her realize the difficulty of her students' in understanding. She decided on the contextual narration of poems.

The teacher realized the need for practice exercises and individual attention for teaching pronunciation. She found a way of helping the students who were finding it difficult to attempt writing exercises, by making them learn expressions suitable for formal and informal occasions.

Finding the prescribed textbook beyond the level of her students' comprehension, she used alternative materials to develop the habit of reading and to give the students a taste of success. While teaching grammar, the teacher resorted to the elicitation technique: she asked the students to describe their routine.

#### ***Better decisions about the use of visual aids and inventing new strategies through reflective practice***

The reflective practice of teacher indicates significant improvement in her classroom practice in terms of teaching strategies and teaching aids. Reflective Practice has evidently helped her think about alternative strategies and teaching aids to make their classroom teaching more effective and interesting.

The teacher uses comics to teach language, and paralanguage, for enabling the students to visualize things easily. She uses newspapers to teach vocabulary and reading practice while learning pronunciation and intonation and thus initiates the students into newspaper reading. She uses stories and jokes for voice modulation, listening to news for listening skills, and role-plays for interaction and conversation skills. She likes to innovate. She says with confidence: "I had to fight the initial boredom, rejection and reluctance. However, once the wall



*of resistance was down, it was very easy motivating them (students).” She gives the utmost value to the students’ feedback. She says, “In this experimental teaching experience, the feedback of the students was quite encouraging.”*

### ***Building on the familiar***

A significant insight that the teacher derived from her reflections was that, for better learning to emerge, she should attempt to build on what was already familiar to the learners.

Thus, reflection enabled the teacher participant to successfully utilize the students’ earlier knowledge either to motivate them or to teach them a new concept.

### ***Opportunities for active involvement***

Data indicate that reflection enabled the teacher participants to realize the need for providing opportunities to their students to interact with the teacher, text or with their friends during the class.

The teacher made her students realize the significance of good and appropriate pronunciation by relating the wrong usages leading to comical situations. She created time-based reading exercises, to retain student interest in and concentration on reading passages, thus helping them to develop a reading habit.

### ***Sensitivity to learners’ difficulties***

The significant insight that the teacher derived from her own reflections was that, for effective teaching-learning to take place in the classroom, the teacher should be sensitive to the difficulties of the students in the learning process and that each lesson should be planned keeping the learners’ difficulties in mind.

### ***Seeking advice and outside support***

The data collected indicate that the teacher realized the need for collaborative work, and sought advice from her senior colleagues to solve her classroom problems and for her self-evaluation.

### ***Utilizing effective classroom management strategies***

Reflection made the teacher realize the need for effective classroom management as a significant requisite for effective teaching.

The teacher participant was found to realize the significance of group activities for creating interaction among their students.

The teacher realized the significance of activity – based teaching and the need for using additional resources in the classroom.

### ***Promoting learner autonomy***

Reflective practice helped the teacher realize both the need to give freedom to the students to choose the activity or the lesson to be taught and the necessity for creating a climate conducive to learning in the classroom.

The teacher tried to offer counseling to students from the vernacular medium of instruction to help them overcome their problems in English.

However, she expressed some concerns also which need to be recorded here. One concern was the amount of time that the process of self-evaluation demanded, though she conceded that the gains far outweighed the demand.

(a) The reflections unmistakably point to changes taking place in the teacher’s practices. She began to question her actions within the classes and became more critical and distanced

towards her habitual practices. For instance, she found her usual way of lecturing in class ineffective and was moving towards the 'elicitation method'. She started using activities, different teaching materials, and the deductive method of teaching grammar.

(b) In the case under investigation in this study, the teacher's classroom decisions were informed ones because they were based on inquiry-derived understandings because of reflective practice.

(c) The decisions the teacher made and the actions she took proved to be experiences of educational value for her. This happened because her reflection on, and inquiry into, her classroom practices took place not as a set of prescriptive skills but rather as a mindset which Dewey (1933) described as a set of attitudes consisting of open-mindedness (*seeking alternatives*), responsibility (*recognizing consequences*), and whole heartedness (*continual self-examination*).

(d) The case investigated in the study point to the role that reflection on, and inquiry into, classroom practices can play as a mechanism for change in teacher's classroom practices as well as a forum for professional development over time.

(e) The case also shows that the teacher constructed her own explanations of teaching derived from her own practices, and the explanations (or "knowledge") were socially negotiated and restructured within their classrooms.

(f) Lastly, the implications of this research for ESL teacher education need to be pointed out. It is evident from the foregoing that reflective practice has considerable potential for the ongoing professional development of teachers in general and ESL teachers in particular and that it is usable and effective factors which will be valued by academic staff education systems.

### Conclusion

The report by the Carnegie Task Force on Teaching as a Profession (Carnegie Forum 1986) recommended the use of teacher-generated case reports as a core source in teacher education. This research may well be regarded as a contribution to that emerging core source in second language teacher education. This researcher hopes that by bringing teachers' ways of knowing through reflective practice into scholarly discussion, this study will strengthen the struggle, waged since the 1980s, to gain validity for inquiry-derived knowledge through reflective practice in ways afforded to disciplinary or theoretical knowledge, which still remains foundational to second language teacher education.

### References

1. Bolton, Gillie (2005). *Reflective Practice: Writing and Professional Development*. London; Thousand Oaks, Ca: SAGE.
2. Boud, D., and Walker, D. (1998) 'Promoting reflection in professional courses: the challenge of context'. *Studies in Higher Education*, 23(2): pp.191-206.
3. Carnegie Forum on Education and the Economy (1986) *A Nation Prepared: Teachers for the 21st Century*. New York: Carnegie Education Foundation.
4. Dewey, J. (1933) *How we think: a restatement of reflective thinking to the educative processes*. Chicago: Henry Regnery.

5. Ho, B., and Richards, J.C. (1993) 'Reflective thinking through teacher journal writing: Myths and realities'. *Prospect: A Journal of Australian TESOL* 8, pp.7-24. In Richards, J.C. and Thomas, S.C. Farrel. (2005) *Professional Development for Language teachers' strategies for Teacher learning*. Cambridge University Press: New York. pp.70-71.
6. Kremer-Hayon, L. (1993) *Teacher self-evaluation: Teacher in their own mirror*. Norwell, Massachusetts: Kluwer.
7. Merriam, S. B. (1988) *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
8. Nunan, D. (1992) The teacher as a decision-maker. In J. Flowerdew, M. Brock, and S. Hsia (eds.), *Perspectives on Second Language Teacher Education*. City University of Hong Kong: Hong Kong. pp. 135-65.
9. Nunan, D. (1992) *Collaborative Language Learning and Teaching*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge.
10. Nunan, D. (1992) *Research Methods in Language Learning*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge.
11. Pollard, Andrew (2005). *Reflective Teaching: Evidence-Informed Professional Practice* New York; London: Continuum.
12. Schon, D.A. (1983) *The reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action*. Basic Books: New York.
13. Schon, D.A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
14. Schon, D.A. (1996) *The Reflective Practitioner: How professionals think in action*. Basic Books: New York.
15. Smith, L. M. (1978) 'An evolving logic of participant observation, educational ethnography and other case studies'. In L. Shulman (ed), *Review of research in education*. Peacock: Chicago.
16. Stake, R. E. (1994) 'Case studies'. In N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. pp. 236-245.
17. Yin, R.K. (2003) *Case Study Research Design and Method*. Thousand Oaks, Sage: California.
18. Yin, Robert K (2009) *Case Study Research. Design and Methods*, Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, 4<sup>th</sup> ed., pp.240